

團體諮商課程對動物保護檢查員同情疲勞影響之研究

吳宗憲¹、辜雅禪^{2*}

¹ 國立臺南大學行政管理學系副教授

² 國立臺南大學行政管理學系碩士

摘要

動物照護工作者需要長期、密集、持續的使用同理心，因而易患有同情疲勞，尤其是收容所的從業者。他們有著愛動物的心，卻要面對收容動物被撲殺、安樂死等痛苦的場面，因此承受更高度度的同情疲勞。過往的研究不乏探究影響同情疲勞以及如何減緩同情疲勞的因素，卻少有研究說明團體諮商課程如何影響同情疲勞。本研究以混合研究方法，結合量化與質化分析，檢視諮商活動對同情疲勞的舒緩效果。量化資料採準實驗研究設計，將 75 名研究對象以非隨機分派的方式分配至四組實驗組及一組控制組，四組實驗組分別施以不同團體諮商課程，控制組則不施以任何介入方案，並於實驗的前、後發放同情疲勞簡短版問卷，將蒐集到的數據以多元迴歸進行分析。質化資料則是將四場諮商課程的互動過程繕打成逐字稿，進行歸納、整理，並作為與參與團體諮商課程的團隊成員以及心理諮商師焦點團體訪談之資料，以補充量化分析的結果。根據量化及質化分析的結果，本研究結果如下：(一)訓練課程有效減緩動物保護檢查員之同情疲勞；(二)根據完形心理學及表達性藝術治療所設計的團體諮商課程比起其他兩場諮商課程對減緩同情疲勞的效果更顯著；(三)不同的團體諮商課程，減緩同情疲勞的程度亦不同。據此提出相關建議，希望提供未來政府推動相關訓練課程時，能夠有效減緩動物保護業務從業者同情疲勞之參考。

關鍵字：同情疲勞、動物保護、團體諮商課程

投稿日期：2019 年 04 月 25 日；接受日期：2019 年 09 月 17 日 *為通訊作者

要感謝「台灣動物平權促進會」秘書長萬宸禎及團隊，在建立心理諮商機制的實務協助，以及隨心沐語的鄧巧玲、陳利根兩位心理諮商師的大力協助，才得以讓本研究順利完成。另本論文曾在 2018 年 10 月 25-26 日，以 *The Effectiveness of Group Counseling on Compassion Fatigue—The Case of Taiwan's Animal Protectors* 為題，在香港城市大學主辦之 UFAW 2018 Animal Welfare Across Borders 會議中發表，感謝當時多位提問者所提供的建設性意見與指正。此外，筆者更感謝三位匿名審查委員對本篇論文所提供的斧正意見，作者也在此致表最大的謝忱，惟文責自負。最後，謹以此文紀念為改善臺灣流浪動物處境而犧牲生命的簡稚澄醫師，並對那些辛勤照護受難動物的收容所獸醫師們表達敬意。

柒、參考文獻

- 王文秀、曹中瑋、陳美芳、蔡順良、廖新春、嚴霽虹(譯)(1992)。有效的輔導(原作者：G. Egan)。臺北：張老師。(原著出版年1988)
- 【Wang, W.-X., Cao, Z.-Y., Chen, M.-F., Cai, S.-L., Liao, X.-C., Yan, Y.-H. (Trans.) (1992). *Change-agent skills B: managing innovation and change* (Original author: G. Egan.). Taipei: Teacher Chang.】
- 何長珠、林原賢(2013)。諮商與心理治療理論與實務。臺北：五南圖書。
- 【He, C.-Z., & Lin, Y.-X. (2013). *Consultation and psychotherapy theory and practice*. Taipei: Wunan Books.】
- 吳宗憲(2017)。建立動物保護公務人力心理諮商及協助支持機制計畫(行政院農業委員會委託之專題研究成果報告 106 農管-04.12-牧-01)。臺北：行政院農業委員會。
- 【Wu, C.-H. (2017). *Establish an animal protection official human rights consultation and support mechanism plan*. Taipei: Council of Agriculture, Executive Yuan】
- 李屏瑤(2014 年 4 月 21 日)。用同理心溝通出人與動物的快樂生活——Leslie《來～跟毛小孩聊天》。取自：<http://okapi.books.com.tw/article/index/3069>
- 【Li, P. Y. (2014, April 21). *Communicating with empathy to make the happy life of people*

- and animals –Leslie's "Come chat with furkids". Retrieved from <http://okapi.books.com.tw/article/index/3069>】
- 岳東卿(2014年8月20日)。醫生兩大職業病：職業倦怠和同情疲勞。大紀元，取自：<http://www.epochtimes.com/b5/14/8/20/n4228956.htm>
- 【Yue, D.-Q. (2014, August 20). Doctors' two major occupational diseases: Burnout and compassion fatigue. *Epoch Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.epochtimes.com/b5/14/8/20/n4228956.htm>】
- 邱珍琬(2012)。諮商理論與技術。臺北：五南圖書。
- 【Chiu, Z.-W. (2012). *Theory and Practice of Counseling*. Taipei: Wunan Books.】
- 邱皓政 (2019)。量化研究與統計分析：SPSS 與 R 資料分析範例解析。臺北：五南圖書。
- 【Chiu, H.-Z. (2019). *Quantitative research and statistical analysis: An analysis of SPSS and R data analysis examples*. Taipei: Wunan Books.】
- 侯禎塘(2002)。藝術治療法對國小啟智班兒童情緒與行為問題輔導效果研究。屏東師院學報，17，329-366。
- 【Hou, Z.-J. (2002). The effects of art therapy on the emotional disorders and problematic behaviors for the children with mental retardation in elementary school. *Journal of Pingtung Teachers College*, 17, 329-366.】
- 陳增穎(譯)(2008)。敘事治療入門(原作者：M. Payne)。臺北：心理出版社。(原著出版年 2000)
- 【Chen, Z.-Y. (Trans.) (2008). *Narrative therapy: An introduction for counsellors* (Original author: M. Payne). Taipei: Psychological Publishing.】
- 陸雅青(2000)。藝術治療團體實務研究—以破碎家庭兒童為例。臺北：五南圖書。
- 【Lu, Y.-Q. (2000). *Practical research on art therapy groups - taking broken family children as an example*. Taipei: Wunan Books.】
- 黃月霞(1980)。兒童諮商與實務。臺北：心理出版社。
- 【Huang, Y.-X. (1980). *Children counseling and practice*. Taipei: Psychological Publishing.】
- 黃惠惠(2007)。情緒與壓力管理。臺北：張老師文化。

- 【Huang, H.-H. (2007). *Stress and emotion regulation*. Taipei: Teacher Chang.】
- 黃慧敏(2015年5月9日)。確診A型口蹄疫 金門撲殺牛隻。中央通訊社。取自：
<http://is.gd/rMw4Oh>
- 【Huang, H.-M. (2015, May 9). Kinmen was diagnosed FMDV types A, then culling cattle. *Central News Agency*. Retrieved from <http://is.gd/rMw4Oh>】
- 楊琳琪、林采蓉、余月里、楊禮謙、蔡素華、洪志秀(2012)。醫院護理人員的悲憫疲憊及其因應策略。《護理雜誌》，59(3)，93-99。doi: 10.6224/JN.59.3.93
- 【Yang, L.-Q., Lin, T.-Y., Yu, Y.-L., Yang, L.-C., Tsai, S.-H., & Hung, C.-H. (2012). Compassion fatigue and coping strategies for hospital nurses. *The Journal of Nursing*, 53(3), 93-99. doi: 10.6224/JN.59.3.93】
- 蔡百蕙(2017年3月14日)。2百萬寵物僅157位動檢員 執法不足、動保法形同虛設。東森新聞雲。取自：<http://www.ettoday.net/news/20170314/883859.htm>
- 【Tsai, B. -H. (2017, Mar. 14). Only 157 animal protection inspector for 2 million pets lead to inadequate law enforcement and animal protection laws are in vain. *ETtoday*. retrieved from <http://www.ettoday.net/news/20170314/883859.htm>】
- 賴念華、陳秉華(1997)。成長團體中藝術媒材的介入：一個成員體驗的歷程分析。《教育心理學報》，29，233-258。doi: 10.6251/BEP.19970901.9
- 【Lai, N.-H., & Chen, P.-H. (1997). The intervention of material arts in growth group: The analysis through a certain member's process of experiencing. *Bulletin of Educational Psychology*, 29, 233-258. doi: 10.6251/BEP.19970901.9】
- Adams, R. E., Boscarino, J. A., & Figley, C. R. (2006). Compassion fatigue and psychological distress among social workers: A validation study. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 76(1), 103-108. doi: 10.1037/0002-9432.76.1.103
- Amighi, J. K., Loman, S., & Sossin, K. M. (1999). The meaning of movement: Developmental perspectives of the Kestenberg Movement Profile. New York, NY: Brunner-Routledge.
- Anchin, J. J. C., & Kiesler, D. J. (1982). *Handbook of interpersonal psychotherapy*. New York, NY: Pergamon Press.

- Aycock, N., & Boyle, D. (2009). Interventions to manage compassion fatigue in oncology nursing. *Clinical Journal of Oncology Nursing*, 13(2), 183-191. doi: 10.1188/09.CJON.183-191
- Benjamin, L. S. (1995). *Interpersonal diagnosis and treatment of personality disorders* (2nd ed.). New York, NY: Guilford Press.
- Berger, R., & M. Gelkopf (2011). An intervention for reducing secondary traumatization and improving professional self-efficacy in well baby clinic nurses following war and terror: A random control group trial. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 48(5), 601-610. doi: 10.1016/j.ijnurstu.2010.09.007
- Bride, B. E., Radey, M., & Figley, C. R. (2007). Measuring compassion fatigue. *Clinical Social Work Journal*, 35(3), 155-163. doi: 10.1007/s10615-007-0091-7
- Burtson, P. L., & J. F. Stichler (2010). Nursing work environment and nurse caring: Relationship among motivational factors. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 66(8), 1819-1831. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2648.2010.05336.x
- Carlson, T. D. (1997) Using art in narrative therapy: Enhancing therapeutic possibilities. *The American Journal of Family Therapy*, 25(3), 271-283. doi: 10.1080/01926189708251072
- Coetzee, S. K., & Klopper, H. C. (2010). Compassion fatigue within nursing practice: A concept analysis. *Nursing & Health Sciences*, 12(2), 235-243. doi: 10.1111/j.1442-2018.2010.00526.x
- Corey, G. (2009). *Theory and practice of counseling and psychotherapy* (8th ed.). Belmont, CA: BrooksCole/Thomson Learning.
- Creswell, J. W., & Clark, V. L. P. (2017). *Designing and conducting mixed methods research* (3rd ed.). Los Angeles: Sage publications.
- Dickinson, G. E., Roof, P. D., & Roof, K. W. (2010). End-of-life issues in United States veterinary medicine schools. *Society & Animals*, 18(2), 152-162. doi: 10.1163/156853010X492006
- Donovan, J., Mills, N., Smith, M., Brindle, L., Jacoby, A., Peters, T., ...Hamdy, F.

- (2002). Improving design and conduct of randomised trials by embedding them in qualitative research: ProtecT (prostate testing for cancer and treatment) study. *British Medical Journal*, 325, 766-769. doi: 10.1136/bmj.325.7367.766
- Doolittle, B. R. (2010). The impact of behaviors upon burnout among parish-based clergy. *Journal of Religion and Health*, 49(1), 88-95. doi: 10.1007/s10943-008-9217-7
- Draucker, C. B. (1998). Narrative therapy for women who have lived with violence. *Archives of Psychiatric Nursing*, 7(3), 162-168. doi: 10.1016/S0883-9417(98)80018-6
- Fakkema, D. (1991). The four phases. *Animal Sheltering*. Retrieved from http://www.animalsheltering.org/resource_library/magazine_articles/mar_apr_2001/four_phases.html
- Farquhar, M. C., Ewing, G., & Booth, S. (2011). Using mixed methods to develop and evaluate complex interventions in palliative care research. *Palliative Medicine*, 25(8), 748-757. doi: 10.1177/0269216311417919
- Figley, C. R. (1995). Compassion fatigue as secondary traumatic stress: An overview. In C. R. Figley (Ed.), *Compassion fatigue: Coping with secondary traumatic stress disorder in those who treat the traumatized* (pp. 248-254). London: Brunner-Routledge.
- Figley, C. R. (1999). Compassion fatigue: Towards a new understanding of the costs of caring. In B. H. Stamm (Ed.), *Secondary traumatic stress: Self-care issues for clinicians, researchers, & educators* (2nd ed., pp. 3-28). Lutherville, MD: Sidran Press.
- Figley, C. R. (2002). *Treating compassion fatigue*. New York, NY: Brunner-Routledge.
- Figley, C. R., & Roop, R. G. (2006). *Compassion fatigue in the animal care community, humane society*. Washington, D. C.: The Humane Society of the United States.

- Figley, C. R., & Stamm, B. H. (1996). Psychometric review of the compassion fatigue self-test. In B. H. Stamm (Ed.), *Measurement of stress, trauma, and adaptation* (pp. 127-130). Lutherville, MD: Sidran Press.
- Flin, R., & Maran, N. (2004). Identifying and training non-technical skills for teams in acute medicine. *Quality and Safety in Health Care*, 13, 80-84. doi: 10.1136/qhc.13.suppl_1.i80
- Gentry, J. E., Baggerly, J. & Baranowsky, A. (2004). Training-as-treatment: Effectiveness of the certified compassion fatigue specialist training. *International Journal of Emergency Mental Health*, 6(3), 147-155.
- Hooper, C., Craig, J., Janvrin, D. R., Wetsel, M. A., & Reimels, E. (2010). Compassion satisfaction, burnout, and compassion fatigue among emergency nurses compared with nurses in other selected inpatient specialties. *Journal of Emergency Nursing*, 36(5), 420-427. doi: 10.1016/j.jen.2009.11.027
- Joinson, C. (1992). Coping with compassion fatigue. *Nursing*, 22(4), 116-121. doi: 10.1097/00152193-199204000-00035
- Josefsson, T., Larsman, P., Broberg, A. G., & Lundh, L. G. (2011). Self-reported mindfulness mediates the relation between meditation experience and psychological well-being. *Mindfulness*, 2(1), 49-58. doi: 10.1007/s12671-011-0042-9
- Keidel, G. C. (2002). Burnout and compassion fatigue among hospice caregivers. *American Journal of Hospice and Palliative Medicine*, 19(3), 200-205. doi: 10.1177/104990910201900312
- Levine, S. K., & Levine, E. G. (Eds.) (1999). *Foundations of expressive arts therapy: Theoretical and clinical perspectives*. London: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.
- Malchiodi, C. A. (2003). *Handbook of art therapy*. New York, NY: The Guilford Press.
- McArthur, M. L., Andrews, J. R., Brand, C., & Hazel, S. J. (2017). The prevalence of compassion fatigue among veterinary students in Australia and the associated

- psychological factors. *Journal of Veterinary Medical Education*, 44(1), 9-21. doi: 10.3138/jvme.0116-016R3
- Meadors, P., & Lamson, A. (2008). Compassion fatigue and secondary traumatization: Provider self care on intensive care units for children. *Journal of Pediatric Health Care*, 22(1), 24-34. doi: 10.1016/j.pedhc.2007.01.006
- Medland, J., Howard-Ruben, J., & Whitaker, E. (2004). Fostering psychosocial wellness in oncology nurses: Addressing burnout and social support in the workplace. *Oncology Nursing Forum*, 31(1), 47-54. doi: 10.1188/04.ONF.47-54
- Mitchell, A. M., Wesner, S., Garand, L., Gale, D. D., Havill, A., & Brownson, L. (2007). A support group intervention for children bereaved by parental suicide. *Journal of Child & Adolescent Psychiatric Nursing*, 20, 3-13. doi: 10.1111/j.1744-6171.2007.00073.x
- Pearlman, L. A. (1999). Self care for trauma therapists. In B. H. Stamm (Ed.), *Secondary traumatic stress-self-care issues for clinicians, researchers and educators* (pp. 51-64). Lutherville, MD: Sidran Press.
- Payne, M. (2000). *Narrative therapy: An introduction for counsellors*. London, Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Pietrantonio, L., & Prati, G. (2008). Resilience among first responders. *African Health Sciences*, 8(3), S14-S20.
- Plano Clark, V. L., Schumacher, K., West, C., Edington, J., Dunn, L. B., Harzstartk, A., ...Miaskowski, C. (2013). Practices for embedding an interpretive qualitative approach within a randomized clinical trial. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, 7(3), 219-243. doi: 10.1177/1558689812474372
- Radey, M., & Figley, C. R. (2007). The social psychology of compassion. *Clinical Social Work Journal*, 35(3), 207-214. doi: 10.1007/s10615-007-0087-3
- Rudolph, J. M., Stamm, B. H., & Stamm, H. E. (1997, November). *Compassion fatigue: A concern for mental health policy, providers, & administration*. Paper presented at the 13th Annual Meeting of the International Society for Traumatic

- Stress Studies, Montreal, PQ, Canada.
- Smith, B. D. (2007). Sifting through trauma: Compassion fatigue and HIV/AIDS. *Clinical Social Work Journal*, 35(3), 193-198. doi: 10.1007/s10615-007-0096-2
- Tehrani, N. (2009). Compassion fatigue: experiences in occupational health, human resources, counselling and police. *Occupational Medicine*, 60(2), 133-138. doi: 10.1093/occmed/kqp174
- Teyber, E. (2000). *Interpersonal process in psychotherapy: A guide for clinical training* (4th ed.). Pacific Grove, CA.: Thomson Brooks/Cole.
- Van den Berg, H., Bester, C., Janse-Van Rensburg-Bonthuyzen, E., Engelbrecht, M., Hlope, H., Summerton, J., ...Van Rensburg, H. C. J. (2006). *Burnout and compassion fatigue in professional nurses: A study in PHC facilities in the free state, with special reference to the antiretroviral treatment programme*. Bloemfontein: Centre for Health Systems Research and Development.
- White, M. & Epston, D. (1990). *Narrative means to therapeutic ends*. New York: Norton.
- White, M. (ed.) (1989). *Selected papers*. Adelaide, Australia: Dulwich Centre.
- White, M. (2006). Children trauma and subordinate storyline development. In D. Denborough (Ed.), *Trauma: Narrative responses to traumatic experience* (pp. 143-165). Adelaide, Australia: Dulwich Centre.
- Yalom, I. D. (1995). *The theory and practice of group psychotherapy* (5th Ed.). New York, NY: Basic Books.
- Yeung, P., White, B., & Chilvers, B. L. (2017). Exploring wellness of wildlife carers in New Zealand: A descriptive study. *Anthrozoös*, 30(4), 549-563. doi: 10.1080/08927936.2017.1370213
- Yoder, E. A. (2010). Compassion fatigue in nurses. *Applied Nursing Research*, 23(4), 191-197. doi: 10.1016/j.apnr.2008.09.003

作者簡介：

吳宗憲 國立臺南大學行政管理學系副教授

電話：0917-697-017

電子郵件：wuchuanghsien@gmail.com

通訊處：70005 台南市中西區樹林街二段 33 號

辜雅禪 國立臺南大學行政管理學系碩士

電話：0988-728-036

電子郵件：qaz349860@gmail.com

通訊處：70005 台南市中西區樹林街二段 33 號

Wu, Chuang Hsien

Associate Professor, Department of Public Administration and Management, National University of Tainan

Tel: 0917-697-017

Email: wuchuanghsien@gmail.com

Address: 33, Sec. 2, Shu-Lin St., West Central Dist., Tainan City 70005, Taiwan (R.O.C.)

Gu, Ya Chan

Master, Department of Public Administration and Management, National University of Tainan

Tel: 0988-728-036

Email: qaz349860@gmail.com

Address: 33, Sec. 2, Shu-Lin St., West Central Dist., Tainan City 70005, Taiwan (R.O.C.)

The Effectiveness of Group Counselling on Compassion Fatigue of Animal Protectors

Chuang-Hsien Wu¹, Ya-Chan Gu^{2*}

¹. Associate Professor, Department of Public Administration and Management, National University of Tainan

². Master, Department of Public Administration and Management, National University of Tainan

**Corresponding author*

Abstract

Animal welfare workers are prone to compassion fatigue caused by long, intense and continuous emotional involvement in helping animals. In particular, animal shelter workers are likely to suffer from even more severe compassion fatigue as they are responsible for painful tasks such as neuter and euthanasia. Even though there were empirical investigations, discussion have never come close to how counselling training may help alleviate compassion fatigue. Through mixed-methods research, combined quantitative and qualitative analysis, this study examined the effects of different counselling approaches on compassion fatigue. A quasi-experimental design was implemented in the quantitative research, and 75 subjects were non-randomly divided into four experimental groups and one control group. Each experimental group was introduced to a different type of counselling approach. The control group did not receive any treatment. The Compassion Fatigue Short Scale (CFS) was conducted before and after the experiment for hypothesis testing by multiple regression analysis. In the part of qualitative research methods, journals of the counselling process were induced to conduct the focus group interview with the research team members and psychologists. The result of quantitative analysis was complemented by the results of qualitative analysis. The research findings have shown that 1) the psychological counselling courses effectively mitigated the compassion fatigue of the participants; 2) the counselling effects of the curricula designed with Gestalt psychology and Expressive Art Therapy were more

obvious than those designed with the other two counselling approaches; 3) the ways of conducting these counselling courses had different impacts on the participants. Based on the findings, we would like to give recommendations to the government on providing related training courses in the future to effectively alleviate the compassion fatigue of animal welfare workers.

Keywords: compassion fatigue, animal protection, group counselling training